W UNIVERSITY *of* WASHINGTON

UW Medicine
UW SCHOOL OF MEDICINE
CENTER FOR HEALTH EQUITY, DIVERSITY & INCLUSION

Search Committee Best Practices©

Diversity = Excellence[1]

UWSOM Center for Health Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion

Prepared by Janice A. Sabin, PhD, MSW

Research Associate Professor

Department of Biomedical Informatics and Medical Education

© 2016, University of Washington, Developed by Sabin, J.A., & Morales, L.S., Center for Health Equity, Diversity and Inclusion, all rights reserved.

Reflection

- In most situations, I am objective in my decision-making

- Biases do not usually influence my decision-making

- People in today's society tend to treat people of different social groups equally

- In academic medicine bias against others is no longer a problem in the area of hiring

Girod, et al., 2/2016

Overview

- UW Mandate

- Value of diversity

- UWSOM Data

- Research- bias in hiring

- Unconscious bias

- Best practices

- Resources

UW Resolution Class C 9 Bulletin No. 539
(unanimously approved, January 2015)

- UW faculty senate approved the resolution: "BE IT RESOLVED **that all University of Washington faculty search committees be given a mandate and adequate resources to participate in some form of Equity, Access, and Inclusion training** developed in collaboration with the Office for Faculty Advancement that informs participants on best practices regarding faculty candidate outreach, assessment, recruitment and retention"

- "BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, **that all UW unit heads are accountable to University leadership for making improvements in the area of faculty diversity** by reporting unit participation in "Equity, Access and Inclusion Hiring" training efforts as well as reporting diversity hiring activities and outcomes"

UW Diversity Blueprint ~~2010 - 2014~~, 2016 - 2020

~~Goal 4:~~ **Goal 1.** Attract and Retain a Diverse Faculty and Staff

- Improve recruitment practices for underrepresented faculty by utilizing best practices
- Craft position descriptions to attract diverse applicant pool
- Emphasize diversity expertise and research in position description
- Collect names from faculty pipeline programs
- Provide greater visibility for faculty/staff affinity groups and University leadership partner with them when recruiting

(2) Office of the University of Washington President
http://www.washington.edu/diversity/diversity-blueprint/

Essential Elements

- ADVANCE: Increase women in academic science and engineering, Funding National Science Foundation, U Wisconsin, U Michigan, U Washington, others
- Essential elements of an effective search
  - o Recruit an excellent and diverse candidate pool
  - o Raise awareness of unconscious assumptions and their influence on evaluation
  - o Ensure fair and thorough review of candidates
  - o Develop effective interview process

(4) http://wiseli.engr.wisc.edu/docs/SearchBook.pdf

AAMC: Diversity 3.0
Diversity = Excellence

- View diversity as a solution not a problem

- Engage people of different skill sets and perspectives to solve problems

- Diversity and inclusion integrated into core workings of institution

- Hiring new faculty represents an opportunity to realize University goals for diversity

(1) Nivet, 2011, Diversity 3.0: A Necessary Systems Upgrade, AcadMed, 86: 1487-1489.

Diversity = Better Critical Thinking for All

Research on value of diversity, price bubbles in markets: diverse (race ethnicity) groups vs. homogeneous groups, analytic thinking, controlled for culture, Texas and Singapore

- Individuals competed in groups to find accurate answers in predicting stock prices

- Answers were 58% more accurate in diverse groups than in homogeneous groups

- Differences only evident when interaction occurred, (pre interaction no differences in groups' answers, not specific skill sets)

- More time spent in interacting in diverse groups = more accurate answers

- Diversity > cognitive friction which disrupts conformity = better critical thinking, improved error detection, more accurate answers

Levine, et al., Ethnic Diversity Deflates Price Bubbles, *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* (PNAS) 2014, Diversity Makes Your Brighter, Levine and Stark, NYT 12/9/2015

Increase Workforce Diversity

- For African Americans racially concordant clinical relationship associated with:

  o Patient adherence to all cardiovascular disease medications (Traylor, et al., 2010)

  o Better doctor-patient communication (Schoenthaler, et al., 2012)

  o More satisfaction with care (Street, et al.,2007)

- Minority physicians are more likely to recognize unfair treatment/ disparities and to work on disparities issues (Getz, & Faden, 2008)

- Investigator race/ethnicity influences minority patient enrollment in clinical trials (Getz, & Faden, 2008)

Underrepresented minority (URM) refers to "those racial and ethnic populations that are underrepresented in the medical profession relative to their numbers in the general population."

Association of American Medical Colleges

UWSOM % URM Faculty

	Black/African American	American Indian/Alaska Native	Hispanic/Latino	Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islanders	Under Represented Minorities
Professors[1]	0.3%	0.0%	1.0%	0.0%	1.3%
Associate Professors[1]	0.7%	0.0%	3.6%	0.0%	4.3%
Assistant Professors[1]	1.8%	0.4%	3.3%	0.0%	5.5%
Clinical Faculty[2]	1.9%	0.6%	6.5%	0.0%	9.1%
Other Faculty[3]	1.8%	0.4%	6.2%	0.1%	8.6%
All Faculty	**1.3%**	**0.2%**	**4.0%**	**0.0%**	**5.5%**

UWSOM Area and Population Demographics

	King County	Washington State	WWAMI[1]	US
URM Groups	17%	17%	16%	34%

Bias: Science Faculty

Science faculty from intensive research institutions, hiring undergrad student lab manager, random assigned male/female

- Rated male student as more competent and hireable

- More pre existing subtle bias against women (modern sexism scale), predicted perceptions of less competence, less hireability, less willing to mentor female student (not male)

- "Liked" female student more, didn't translate to perceptions of competence, salary or job offer

- Male and female faculty equally likely to show subtle bias

Moss-Racusin et al., 2012

Bias in Hiring: Race

Are Emily and Greg more employable than Lakisha and Jamal?

- Help wanted ads, Boston, Chicago, outcome= job call backs

- Identical resumes, 70% college degree, only difference name

- White names 50% greater chance of receiving call back than Black names

- Higher quality resumes- 30% call back for white candidate, 9% for black candidate

- Employers who listed "equal opportunity employer" had same amount of bias

Bertrand & Mullainathan, 2004

Bias in Letters of Recommendation: Medicine

Analysis of letters of recommendation for medical faculty, one large US medical school, 3 year period

Letters for female candidates (vs. male)
- Significantly shorter
- Showed less professional respect (first name female vs. Dr. for male)
- Contained doubt raisers (24% vs. 12%)
- Mentioned how they relate interpersonally (16% vs. 4%)
- Referred to personal life (6% vs. 1%)

Letters for male candidates (vs. female)
- Referred more frequently to research (62% vs. 35%), and publications (13% vs. 3%)

Trix and Psenka, 2003

Bias Expressed in Letters

- **Negative language:** *While not the best student I have had*

- **Hedges:** *It appears that her/his health is stable*

- **Unexplained***: Now that she/he has chosen to leave the laboratory*

- **Faint praise***: She/he is void of mood swings and temper tantrums*

- **Grindstone***: She/he is conscientious and meticulous*

Trix & Psenka, 2003

Implicit Bias: Definition

"attitudes or stereotypes that affect our understanding, decision making, and behavior, without our even realizing it"

"*Implicit bias in the courtroom*", UCLA Law Review(2012) by Jerry Kang, et al.

First Impressions

- First impressions of a person as attractive, likeable, competent, trustworthy, and aggressive are made quickly (implicit)

- Exposure to a face for 100ms, or one-tenth of a second, was enough to make an assessment of these traits when viewing an unknown face

- Judgment did not change with increased view time of 1000ms, one second, but confidence in the judgment did increase with additional time

Willis & Todorov, 2006

Social Cognition: How We Understand and Interpret the Social World

Two levels of cognition:

- **Explicit** refers to attitudes and beliefs we know we have and report- rational/higher level thinking

- **Implicit** refers to attitudes that are not readily apparent to the individual, more automatic, unconscious, we are unaware- unconscious/lower level thinking

Greenwald & Banaji, 1995, Banaji & Greenwald, 2013

Implicit Bias and Behavior

Despite egalitarian beliefs, individuals may show prejudiced behavior in certain situations:

- Clinical/other ambiguity
- Situational uncertainty
- Heavy workload
- Fatigue
- Pressure of time

Croskerry, 2001, 2010

Implicit Bias is Common

- Implicit bias is common and pervasive in the general population, in society

- Race, ethnicity, gender, weight, ability, age, sexual orientation, other areas

- MDs show bias similar to others with doctoral degrees, other providers, others in society

- Implicit bias exists even among those who hold egalitarian beliefs

Nosek, et al., 2007, Sabin et al., 2009, Hill et al., 2015

Measuring Hidden Bias:
The Implicit Association Test (IAT)

- The most widely used measure of implicit social cognition

- Rapidly sort and pair images and words as they flash on a computer screen, using right and left computer key

- Based on the assumption that response to images that are more easily associated will be faster than response to images that are less easily associated

- **Project Implicit®- https://implicit.harvard.edu**

Greenwald, et al., 1998, Greenwald, et al., 2009

Implicit Bias: Race

If there is an association that is faster for

**with the concept of "good"
than**

with the concept of "good"

70% of IAT test takers show stronger association of White rather than Black face and concept of "good"

Gender Bias IAT

Male versus **Female** (Ben, Julia)

Career versus **Family** (management, home)

- 72% of IAT test takers show male-career association rather than female-career

ABILITY IAT

Disabled versus Abled

Good: Joy, Love, Peace, Wonderful, Pleasure, Glorious, Laughter, Happy
Bad: Agony, Terrible, Horrible, Nasty, Evil, Awful, Failure, Hurt

Sexuality IAT

Sexuality IAT:

Lesbian vs. straight

Gay vs. straight

Good vs. bad

Words for good such as "happy"

Words for bad such as "awful"

Implicit Race Bias and Employment

- Identical CVs, lecturer post, manipulated by name and photo, asked to review and recommend 2/4 candidates for interview

- White participants with high implicit race bias were **ten times more likely** to choose two white candidates for lecturer post than two non-white candidates, despite identical CVs

- Higher implicit race bias- more time looking at positive information in white candidate CV and less time looking at positive information in black candidate CV

Beattie, et al., 2013

How Hidden Biases Create Barriers

UW ADVANCE (adapted from Moody, 2010)

The search, selection, and promotion process :

- Snap judgments of an applicant

- Presumptions of competence based upon unconscious negative stereotypes

- Feeling more comfortable with and confident in people who share one's own culture

- Positive stereotypes that influence perceptions of competence

- Subjective assessments of a candidate's potential rather than accomplishments

(3) http://www.engr.washington.edu/lead/biasfilm/

Interrupt the Influence of Implicit Bias on Behavior

Organizational and individual
- Collect data
- Become aware of biases
- Be careful about decisions by "intuition"
- Examine decisions in a systematic way
- Reduce discretion in decision making
- Use decision tools, structure processes
- Objective processes, clinical guidelines, check lists

Blind Spot, Banaji & Greenwald, 2103, Banaji, Brazerman, Chug, 2003, AAMC 2009

Best Practices to Increase Diversity

- http://advance.washington.edu/resources/facrecruitment.html
- Peek, Kim, Johnson, & Vela, AcadMed 2013, 88:405-412
- AAMC, 20011, Workshop: Improving the Diversity of Medical School Faculties: Challenges and Opportunities
- CREO Advance http://www.advance.arizona.edu/eval

Best Practices
Committee Formation and Training

- Committee Composition
  - o Include faculty who value diversity and excellence
  - o Include women
  - o Include faculty from underrepresented groups
  - o Dean/Chair meet with the committee to emphasize importance of diversity

- Committee Training
  - o Understand unconscious bias in search process
  - o Be aware of biases and assumptions - your own, in letters of recommendation, common stereotypes
  - o Best practices

UW Diversity Statement

Include UW Diversity Statement in job description, web site, application materials, other

At the University of Washington, diversity is integral to excellence. We value and honor diverse experiences and perspectives, strive to create welcoming and respectful learning environments, and promote access, opportunity and justice for all.

Diversity Valued in Appointment and Promotion

University of Washington Faculty Code: Chapter 24. Section 24-32. Scholarly and Professional Qualifications of Faculty Members

> *In accord with the University's expressed commitment to excellence and equity, contributions in scholarship and research, teaching, and service that address diversity and equal opportunity may be included among the professional and scholarly qualifications for appointment and promotion outlined below.*

- You may evaluate a candidate on their work in these areas **gleaned from CV**

WA State I-200

- Under I-200 outreach efforts to expand the qualified applicant pool **are allowed and encouraged**

- Under I-200, race, ethnicity, gender, cannot be used as the main criteria to select a candidate

Best Practices: Preparation and Outreach

- Expand your applicant pool to strive for diversity
- Always be recruiting, mine many resources, list of candidates generated from URM faculty
- Network at national conferences
- Personal contact with promising URM faculty
- Chairs go "extra mile" to make personal connections

Best Practices: Outreach cont.

- Grow your own- residency programs, fellows
- Include proactive language in job description
- Advertise broadly
- Contact minority institutions
- Understand WA State Initiative 200

- Affinity groups- professional organizations, outreach

Measuring Diversity of Applicant Pool

- Federal/state affirmative action compliance- university must request information about the race/ethnicity, sex, age, disability, and veteran's status of all applicants for each position **Office of Equal Opportunity and Affirmative Action (EOAA)**

- An **Affirmative Action Information Request (AAIR)** link must be sent to all applicants by the unit's human resources administrator (or designee) **in a timely manner during the competitive phase of the recruitment process**

- Applicant completion of the form is voluntary

- EOAA's ability to provide accurate data about the applicant pool is dependent on the AAIR

Reading/Writing Letters of Recommendation

- Be aware that those who write recommendations may be biased

- Letters should focus on the applicant, record

- Evaluate accomplishments

- Discuss personal characteristics only relevant to potential for growth and job performance

(6)ADVANCE, University of Michigan, Program Materials, 2009, page 20

Best Practices Evaluation

- Reach consensus on criteria and how qualifications will be weighted **before review candidates**

- Avoid too narrow focus of candidate research area

- Structured interview process, standardized questions

- Use a standard candidate evaluation form/rubric

- Evaluate entire application

- Interview more than one member of underrepresented group

- Be able to defend every decision for advancing or eliminating

Resources: Search Committee

http://depts.washington.edu/cedi/wp_cedi/

UWSOM CEDI Search Committee Toolkit

- Search checklist

- Interview scoring templates

- Resources to learn about hidden bias

- Bias in letters of reference

- How-to guide to inclusion

- Best practices - choice of approach

- WA State Initiative 200

- How to expand trusted networks for recruitment

- Appropriate questions in an interview

- Interview question templates

- Documentation of attention to diversity in search process

- Diversity Connect

- More

UW Resources

- The **UW Faculty Recruitment Initiative** provides departments with supplemental funds to enhance faculty recruitment packages aims to build a diverse and inclusive faculty. Assessment of diversity is gleaned from the CV, not based upon the person's background (there have been awards for health sciences departments)

- Greater Washington State Higher Education Recruitment Consortium **(GWS HERC)** "University of Washington new collaborative effort to help institutions recruit diverse faculty and staff and assist dual-career couples seeking employment throughout the state" (UW, the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, Fred Hutchinson Cancer Research Center)

(7)http://www.washington.edu/diversity/faculty-advancement/

(8) HERC - http://www.washington.edu/diversity/faculty-advancement/

Metrics

- Collect institutional demographic data annually

- Monitor faculty turnover

- Collect qualitative data about faculty who leave

- In search process collect metrics- monitor diversity of candidates

- Establish accountability measures

(9) https://www.aamc.org/initiatives/diversity/portfolios/

Collect SOM Data:

Diversity of applicant pool (EOAA), diversity of new hires, outreach activities, use of best practices

Reflection

- In most situations, I am objective in my decision-making

- Biases do not usually influence my decision-making

- People in today's society tend to treat people of different social groups equally

- In academic medicine bias against others is no longer a problem in the area of hiring

Girod, et al., 2/2016

Thank You

sabinja@uw.edu

http://depts.washington.edu/cedi/wp_cedi/cedi-search-committee-toolkit/

Online References

1. Nivet, 2011, Diversity 3.0: A Necessary Systems Upgrade, AcadMed, 86: 1487-1489.

2. http://www.washington.edu/diversity/diversity-blueprint/

3. http://www.engr.washington.edu/lead/biasfilm/

4. http://wiseli.engr.wisc.edu/docs/SearchBook.pdf

5. ADVANCE, University of Michigan, Program Materials, 2009, page 20

6. AAMC: https://www.aamc.org/members/leadership/catalog/178420/unconscious_bias.html

7. HERC - http://www.washington.edu/diversity/faculty-advancement/

8. http://advance.washington.edu/resources/facrecruitment.html

9. https://www.aamc.org/initiatives/diversity/portfolios/